




June 2017

The Historical Representation of Native Americans within Primary- and Intermediate-Level Trade Books

John Holden Bickford
Eastern Illinois University

Lori A. Knoechel
Eastern Illinois University

Follow this and additional works at: https://thekeep.eiu.edu/the_councilor

 Part of the [Curriculum and Instruction Commons](#), [Educational Methods Commons](#), [Elementary Education Commons](#), [Elementary Education and Teaching Commons](#), [Junior High, Intermediate, Middle School Education and Teaching Commons](#), and the [Pre-Elementary, Early Childhood, Kindergarten Teacher Education Commons](#)

Illinois Council of Social Studies

Recommended Citation

Bickford, John Holden and Knoechel, Lori A. (2017) "The Historical Representation of Native Americans within Primary- and Intermediate-Level Trade Books," *The Councilor: A Journal of the Social Studies*: Vol. 78: No. 2, Article 4.

Available at: https://thekeep.eiu.edu/the_councilor/vol78/iss2/4

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at The Keep. It has been accepted for inclusion in The Councilor: A Journal of the Social Studies by an authorized editor of The Keep. For more information, please contact tabruns@eiu.edu.

Illinois Council of Social Studies



The Historical Representation of Native Americans within Primary- and Intermediate-Level Trade Books

John Holden Bickford
Lori A Knoechel
Eastern Illinois University

American elementary school children often learn about the sacrifices of veterans on Veterans Day, Columbus's explorations around Columbus Day, and Dr. King's experiences and accomplishments on Martin Luther King Day. Many states designate a day to Native Americans and require schools to include corresponding curricula. Illinois, as an illustrative example, designates the fourth Friday of September as *American Indian Day* and schools are required to engage in "appropriate exercises in commemoration of the American Indians" (Illinois State Law, 1961). Elementary teachers are expected to focus part of their curricula on Native Americans for at least that day. Teachers, however, must balance this requirement with a host of other expectations that originate within state and national initiatives.

Current educational initiatives require students to read more complex, diverse, and non-fiction texts beginning in the elementary grades (National Council for the Social Studies [NCSS], 2013; National Governors Association Center for Best Practices & Council of Chief State School Officers [NGA & CCSSO], 2010). The changes significantly affect English/language arts and social studies/history, which have been figuratively synonymous with fiction and textbooks, respectively (Heafner & Groce, 2007; McMurrer, 2008; Wilton & Bickford, 2012). The educational initiatives do not, however, provide or suggest curricular resources for teachers to make the substantive changes (Sapers, 2015).

Textbooks, primary sources, and trade books are available options; trade books perhaps raise fewer concerns than textbooks and primary sources for elementary teachers. Textbooks are traditionally popular for their comprehensive coverage; they are also expensive and, at times, historical misrepresentative (e.g. Chick, 2006; Clark, Allard, & Mahoney, 2004; Eraqi, 2015; Lindquist, 2009, 2012; Matusevich, 2006; Miller, 2015; Roberts, 2015). Further, a textbook's narrative is shallow in depth, cumbersome in language, and does not invite juxtaposition of multiple, divergent perspectives (Loewen, 2007; Wineburg, 2001), the latter being a key principle of the educational initiatives (NCSS, 2013; NGA & CCSSO, 2010). Primary sources invite students' scrutiny of their diverse and sometimes competing perspectives. While primary sources are widely accessible and free for classroom teachers, young students may find the decades- and sometimes centuries-old prose and syntax to be impenetrable (Wineburg & Martin, 2009; Wineburg, Smith, & Breakstone, 2012). Furthermore, grasping the intricacies of historical documents is a developed and arguably unnatural skill (Bickford, 2013b; Nokes, 2011; Wineburg, 2001). Elementary students find trade books comprehensible and engaging; teachers appreciate trade books' low-cost and capacity to connect different curricula (McMurrer, 2008; Wilton & Bickford, 2012). Dozens, and sometimes hundreds, of trade books distill both admired and esoteric historical figures,



events, and eras. Trade books' popularity, though, gives a false impression of their cultural and historical representation.

Empirical research indicates trade books' cultural and historical representation are erratic and seemingly contingent to the central topic. Historical fiction trade books are notoriously misrepresentative, which is perhaps expected considering the authorial liberties of fiction authors (e.g. Eaton, 2006; Powers, 2003; Schwebel, 2011, 2014; Williams, 2009). Non-fiction trade books' historical misrepresentations are both frequent and unpredictable. For instance, historical trade books about Eleanor Roosevelt, Franklin Roosevelt, Amelia Earhart, and Abraham Lincoln were relatively representative, yet books about Christopher Columbus, Rosa Parks, Helen Keller, and Anne Sullivan (Macy) were egregiously misrepresentative (Bickford, 2013a; Bickford & Badal, 2017; Bickford, Dilley, & Metz, 2015; Bickford & Lindsay, 2017; Bickford & Rich, 2014a; Bickford & Silva, 2016). Child labor-based trade books were reasonably representative, whereas books about Thanksgiving, the Civil Rights Movement, the Holocaust, slavery in America, and Native Americans were wantonly ahistorical (Bickford, 2015; Bickford & Hunt, 2014; Bickford & Rich, 2014b, 2015a, 2015b; Bickford & Schuette, 2016; Bickford, Schuette, & Rich, 2015; Schwebel, 2011; Williams, 2009).

The published research, however, has at least three limitations. First, the research that exists is scant. Just seven historical figures and only six historical eras, events, or movements have been empirically examined. Second, the data samples appear to be problematic. Most empirical studies included unequal portions of historical fiction and non-fiction; at times, they did not distinguish nor juxtapose the two genres. Readers' expectations of historical fiction and non-fiction are different because writers of historical fiction (rightfully) take many authorial liberties (e.g. Eaton, 2006; Powers, 2003; Schwebel, 2011, 2014; Williams, 2009). Researchers could better extrapolate genre-based patterns of (mis)representation if the data sample included equal portions of both genres. Finally, most researchers permitted wide ranges of ages of readers, especially at the elementary level. It is convenient to categorize according to elementary, middle level, and high school, but primary- and intermediate-level elementary students have dramatically different schema, cognition, and literacy skills. Perhaps primary- and intermediate-level elementary students should not be grouped as a singular category. As with genre, researchers could better analyze trade books organized in smaller grade ranges. Only one study distinguished and juxtaposed trade books targeting primary elementary readers with those intended for intermediate elementary students (Bickford & Rich, 2015b). The limitations and problematic elements of previous research informed our methodological choices.

Our research is based on five presumptions. First, trade books are an age-appropriate curricular tool to elicit students' interest. Second, trade books cannot—and should not be expected to—incorporate historians' nuance and detail. Third, misrepresentative myths and sterilized tales do not substitute for history. Fourth, teachers may not suspect that their selected trade books perpetuate stereotypical yarns, but they should be aware nonetheless. Fifth, misrepresentative trade



books can be a valuable curricular resource if the teacher positions students to scrutinize—and not just comprehend—their narratives.

Methods

Our research cohered with rigorous qualitative research methods from the original data pool through data collection and analysis (Krippendorff, 2013; Maxwell, 2010; Zhang & Wildemuth, 2009). Similar empirical research of textbooks (e.g. Chick, 2006; Clark et al., 2004; Eraqi, 2015; Lindquist, 2009, 2012; Loewen, 2007; Matusevich, 2006; Miller, 2015; Roberts, 2015) and trade books (e.g. Chick & Corle, 2012; Chick, Slekár, & Charles, 2010; Desai, 2014; Tschida, Ryan, & Ticknor, 2014) informed our approach. Valuable research has examined emergent patterns dependent on publication date (Eaton, 2006; Schwebel, 2011, 2014), yet classroom teachers might struggle to locate a class set of out-of-print books. We, therefore, intended to examine trade books that could potentially be used in classrooms and, therefore, considered only in-print trade books.

We first sought to establish a current, representative, and sizeable sample. We used Amazon, Barnes and Noble, Booksource, and Scholastic, which are retail sites for children's literature, and NoveList, an academic site for elementary-level trade books. We searched using key words and themes (i.e. Native American, American Indian, Iroquois, Cahokia) to achieve an inclusive data pool. To examine how patterns of representation varied in books intended for different reading and grade levels, we triangulated the books' readability using Advantage/TASA Open Standard, Lexile, Grade Level Expectations, and Developmental Reading Assessment. We then separated our data sample into two categories: one for primary-level elementary and another for intermediate-level elementary learners. To consider how patterns of representation change in books of different genres, we also separated our data sample into two categories: fiction (including historical fiction) and non-fiction (inclusive of all subgenres). We employed *systematic sampling* protocol to gather a sizeable, representative sample from the data pool that was equal parts fiction and non-fiction with identical portions of books intended for primary- and intermediate-level readers ($n = 20$; 20%) (see Appendix I, *Data Sample*).

During analysis, we incorporated both open coding and axial coding. We utilized open coding during the first reading. In it, we individually recorded content included and excluded; we made notes of patterns and anomalies to the patterns. Upon completion of our initial review of the entire sample, we discussed our individual notes and synthesized the observations into tentative, testable codes. To determine the frequency and reliability of the codes, we employed axial coding. During this step, we individually reread each book to determine the presence (or absence) of content. In doing so, we considered *how* content was included to determine if a young reader would likely digest the concepts denoted or connoted by an adult author. Multiple readings and modification to the content analysis tool are necessary because historical and cultural misrepresentations are, at times, oblique (see Appendix II, *Content Analysis Tool*). The steps to generate empirical findings align with best practice methods (Krippendorff, 2013).



Findings

We examined equal numbers of fiction ($n = 10$) and non-fiction ($n = 10$) trade books with half written for primary elementary students and half intended for intermediate elementary students (see Appendix III, *Trade Books' Composition*). We analyzed each book multiple times to discern how Native Americans' culture and history were represented in trade books for elementary students and the degree to which patterns of representation were based on genre and the intended age of the reader. Within the appendices, we report individual elements in specific trade books (Appendix IV, *Individualized Findings*) and also collective patterns among the data sample (Appendix V, *Quantified Findings*). Here, we discuss four significant findings: publication patterns, tribal name, historical connections, and cultural elements.

Publication Patterns

We did not construct working hypotheses so as to not prejudice our analyses. If we had, we could not have speculated at the palpable pattern emergent in trade books' publication dates. As noted in Appendix Five, nearly two-thirds ($n = 13$; 65%) were published more than 15 years old. In a random sample, just one trade book (5%) was published within the last five years. The sample was relatively small, yet the data indicate a sharp decline in new trade books about Native Americans. This suggests, but certainly does not prove, a decline in interest in Native American culture and history.

Publishers of children's books respond to perceived interest levels of the audience; there is a capitalist element to such publishing. Perhaps, publishers have inferred a decline in interest by the elementary-level readership. The inference of a decline in interest perhaps stands in contrast to the burgeoning push for Indigenous Peoples Day, in lieu of the seemingly myopic Columbus Day, and the relatively recent bill legislating the Friday after Thanksgiving as Native American Heritage Day (H.J. Res. 62, 2008). These events suggest a more prominent place for Native Americans within contemporary consciousness than, say, two decades ago. The sharp decline in published trade books, however, remains both conspicuous and concerning. Of the historical topics that have been empirically examined, not one noted a conspicuous decline in recent publications (Bickford, 2013a, 2015; Bickford, Dilley, & Metz, 2015; Bickford & Hunt, 2014; Bickford & Rich, 2014a, 2014b, 2015a, 2015b; Bickford & Schuette, 2016; Bickford, Schuette, & Rich, 2015; Bickford & Silva, 2016; Eaton, 2006; Powers, 2003; Schwebel, 2011, 2014; Williams, 2009).

Tribal Name

A large portion of trade books omitted reference to a specific tribal name. This may seem nonessential or trivial until affiliation and identity are considered. If asked to distinguish themselves by a singular classification, an American citizen would not likely identify as North American just as an Egyptian national would not self-categorize as African. Identity is not a conglomerate nor is it determined by geographical locale. Identity is deeply meaningful, yet



difficult to quantify singularly. Almost half of the books ($n = 9/20$; 45%) did not mention a specific tribal name.

Table 1

Denotations Used within Primary and Elementary Trade Books

	<u>Specific Tribal Name</u>	<u>Indian</u>	<u>No Denotation</u>
Primary	*Ashrose (1993) *Earth (1998) Jeffers (1991) *Matzke (2013)	*Evento (2004) *Jenner (2000)	Goble (1988) *Goble (1997) Martin (1992) Martin & Archambault (1966)
Intermediate	Bruchac (1998) *Fradin & Fradin (2002) Fritz (2002) Mikaelsen (2001) Pearsall (2007) *Roessel (1993) *Tallchief & Wells (1999)	*dePaola (1996)	Dorris (1992) Dorris (1996)

Note. The asterisk (*) denotes a non-fiction trade book.

Denotations Used within Primary and Elementary Trade Books indicates that most books intended for intermediate students provided a specific tribal name ($n = 7/10$; 70%) whereas most primary-level books included no specific tribal name ($n = 6/10$; 60%). Perhaps authors of primary level books determined tribal names to be too cumbersome for the youngest readers. The omission, however, positions students to view distinct peoples as a conglomerate or without dissimilar affiliations. Due to their many similarities, perhaps it is reasonable to associate—or even merge—the Seneca, Cayuga, Oneida, Onondaga, and Mohawk as singularly Iroquois, yet there are clear, consequential distinctions between the Iroquois of New York and the Incas of South America. The indigenous peoples of North and South America were—and are—a cornucopia of gradations (Mann, 2005, 2011). Trade books that make no reference to singular tribal names connote a coalescence that misrepresents tribal diversity. Such an omission should not prevent students from reading a specific book, but a teacher should recognize and constructively address this problematic element.

Historical Connections



Native Americans should not be characterized, nor be positioned to be viewed, as an obscure remnant of a bygone era. Similarly, their interactions with European explorers, settlers, colonists, and Americans should not be disregarded (Diamond, 2005, 2011; Mann, 2005, 2011). One would not expect children's literature to detail historical connections or include nuanced and gruesome content, yet the absence of any and all historical subject matter is similarly dubious. As Table Two indicates, both fiction and non-fiction trade books and books intended for primary elementary students largely omitted historical content.

Table 2

Historical Connections within Primary and Elementary Trade Books

	<u>Historical Connections</u>	<u>No Historical Connections</u>
Primary	*Ashrose (1993) Jeffers (1991) *Jenner (2000)	*Earth (1998) *Evento (2004) Goble (1988) *Goble (1997) Martin (1992) Martin & Archambault (1966) *Matzke (2013)
Intermediate	Dorris (1992) Dorris (1996) *Fradin & Fradin (2002) Fritz (2002) Pearsall (2007) *Roessel (1993) *Tallchief & Wells (1999)	Bruchac (1998) *dePaola (1996) Mikaelsen (2001)

Note. The asterisk (*) denotes an informational text or non-fiction trade book.

Half of all the reviewed trade books ($n = 10/20$; 50%)—and half of all non-fiction trade books ($n = 5/10$; 50%)—made no reference to any historical connections with Europeans, American expansion, or the genocide of Native Americans. There was a discernible age-level pattern as most intermediate-level trade books ($n = 7/10$; 70%) referenced some historical events. None of the trade books, though, provided a reference, even an age-appropriate one, to what many have characterized as genocide (Diamond, 2011; Mann, 2011, Zinn, 1980/2003). This figurative sequel to the typical Native American tale is both inconvenient and a burden of blame for white America, yet to disregard this undesirable historical aspect positions Native Americans as an age-old artifact of a distant past; it ignores both their victimhood and white America's guilt. A teacher should be aware of trade books that do not reference any historical connections. We later offer teachers creative and engaging uses for misrepresentative trade books.



Cultural Elements

Content analysis research, at times, identifies patterns of representation that are not in need of critique or supplementation. The reviewed trade books referenced various archetypal, representative elements of distinct Native American tribes and relied on few stereotypical, misrepresentative aspects. In other words, trade books detailed specific traditions, customs, rights of passage, aspects of religion, and other historically representative elements more frequently than simplistic clichés, like chasing buffalo or wearing feathers while dancing around the fire in front of a tepee. The vast majority of books ($n = 19/20$; 95%) explicitly referenced three or more archetypal elements and almost half noted six or more ($n = 8/20$; 40%). Most trade books ($n = 12/20$; 60%) included two or fewer stereotypical aspects. The stereotypical qualities, when included, supplemented other archetypal elements; in other words, stereotypical qualities were not independent of archetypal elements as no book relied entirely on stereotypical facets of Native American culture. Table Three illustrates how both primary and intermediate trade books had far more culturally representative than culturally misrepresentative elements.

Table 3

Archetypal and Stereotypical Elements within Primary and Elementary Trade Books

	<u>Author</u>	<u>Archetypal Elements</u>	<u>Stereotypical Aspects</u>
Primary	*Ashrose (1993)	Six or More	Three-Five
	*Earth (1998)	Three-Five	Zero-Two
	*Evento (2004)	Three-Five	Three-Five
	Goble (1988)	Zero-Two	Three-Five
	*Goble (1997)	Three-Five	Three-Five
	Jeffers (1991)	Three-Five	Zero-Two
	*Jenner (2000)	Three-Five	Zero-Two
	Martin (1992)	Three-Five	Zero-Two
	Martin & Archambault (1966)	Three-Five	Zero-Two
	*Matzke (2013)	Six or More	Three-Five
Intermediate	Bruchac (1998)	Six or More	Three-Five
	*dePaola (1996)	Three-Five	Three-Five
	Dorris (1992)	Three-Five	Zero-Two
	Dorris (1996)	Three-Five	Zero-Two
	*Fradin & Fradin (2002)	Six or More	Zero-Two
	Fritz (2002)	Six or More	Zero-Two
	Mikaelsen (2001)	Six or More	Zero-Two
	Pearsall (2007)	Three-Five	Zero-Two
	*Roessel (1993)	Six or More	Zero-Two
	*Tallchief & Wells (1999)	Six or More	Three-Five

Note. The asterisk (*) denotes an informational text or non-fiction trade book.



Viewed in relation to the previous subsection on historical connections, the trade books—both for primary and intermediate elementary students—were more culturally representative than historically representative. This is positive and perhaps expected considering the ease with which culture and story-telling can be intertwined by a clever author. An author might struggle more with navigating age-appropriate historical content than incorporating cultural content.

Discussion

Trade books, as noted above, have many positive attributes that elementary teachers value. They are an appropriate curricular resource for English/language arts and social studies/history. They do, however, have some problematic elements. While many trade books perpetuate a myth or include misrepresentative content, educators should not simply jettison a less-than-perfect book. They should be aware of the misrepresentative components and mitigate them accordingly. We offer some suggestions that cohere with state and national educational initiatives.

First, students should participate in multiple literacy circles. Students should read multiple trade books on the same topic or era. When assigning or offering trade books, teachers already consider age-appropriate content and developmentally-appropriate reading levels. They could also intentionally select books with disparate degrees of historicity or perhaps pair a historical fiction trade book with a non-fiction text. Just as distinctions will stand out more sharply when contrasting black with white than when juxtaposing two gradations of gray, the same logic applies to the pedagogical choice of requiring students to read books of different genres or disparate historicity. Students can, perhaps, best consider areas of convergence and divergence when reading starkly different texts. Active scrutiny originates naturally from purposeful juxtaposition of incongruent texts about the same person or era in ways similar to watching a movie adapted from a book. Students' involvement in multiple literacy circles positions them to discuss these similarities and differences.

Second, students should engage in close readings of complementary and corresponding primary sources. Supplementing a narrative with primary source material enables students' visualization of complex, seemingly foreign concepts. Students could view a dozen images—photographs or drawings—that illustrate a theme or event within the trade book; the teacher could ask students to consider *where* their proper location *could* be within the trade book or how the author *might* have written the summary underneath the image. Text-based primary sources may be more difficult to grasp than visual sources; written historical documents may not excite students like visual primary sources do. Teachers are encouraged to modify the length and language while preserving the historical essence of these text-based primary sources (Wineburg & Martin, 2009; Wineburg et al., 2012). Various curricular and methodological guides can assist teachers in how to best facilitate students' close readings of the primary source material (Austin & Thompson, 2015; Loewen, 2010; Monte-Sano, De La Paz, & Felton, 2014; Wineburg, Martin, & Monte-Sano, 2011).



Finally, there is a myriad of guidance for teachers interested bolstering their literature selections and incorporating primary sources. *American Indians in Children's Literature* offers teachers critical analyses about and close readings of children's and young adult trade books. Primary sources are both available and free for classroom use. The *Smithsonian* has a *Resources for Teaching American History* section devoted entirely to the interactions between Native Americans and both European colonists and, eventually, American citizens. These include etchings, images of artifacts, and, most evocatively and quite rare, more than two dozen transcribed sources written by Native Americans. The *Library of Congress* has a primary source collection entitled *Assimilation Through Education*, which includes photographs, federal reports, maps, audio files of authentic songs, and even some early film footage. The *Gilder Lehrman Institute of American History* provides original images of visual primary sources (e.g. maps, portraits, and etchings) and text-based documents (e.g. letters, diary entries, and subjugation orders). Unlike the documents on *Smithsonian* and *Library of Congress*, the *Gilder Lehrman Institute* does not provide transcriptions of the written primary sources. As mentioned above, transcriptions can be easily copied, pasted, and modified in age-appropriate ways for length and language. Images of original letters must be transcribed by the teacher or students might struggle with the centuries-old prose (and cursive). The *National Archives and Records Administration* offers a cornucopia of census records and various treaties (between colonial leaders or American government officials and Native Americans), but these are quite cumbersome. This is intended to be an illustrative, not exhaustive, list of suggestions.

Once aware of their presence, teachers can intentionally confront the myths and misrepresentations within the trade books. While not a comprehensive list of all the possibilities, these suggestions are intended to evoke curiosities and guide discipline-specific literacies. Teachers can adjust the pedagogy as they see fit.



References

- Amazon. Retrieved from www.amazon.com
- American Indians in Children's Literature. Retrieved from <http://americanindiansinchildrensliterature.blogspot.com/>
- Austin, H. & Thompson, K. (2015). *Examining the evidence: Seven strategies for teaching with primary sources*. North Mankato, MN: Maupin House Publishing.
- Barnes&Noble. Retrieved from www.barnesandnoble.com
- Bickford, J. (2013a). Examining historical (mis)representations of Christopher Columbus within children's literature. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 8(2), 1-24.
- Bickford, J. (2013b). Initiating historical thinking in elementary schools. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 8(3), 60-77.
- Bickford, J. (2015). Assessing and addressing the historical (mis)representations of the Civil Rights Movement within children's literature. *The History Teacher*, 48(4), 693-736.
- Bickford, J. & Badal, T. (2017). Trade books' historical representation of Eleanor Roosevelt, *First Lady of the World*. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 11(3), 1-18.
- Bickford, J., Dilley, D., & Metz, V. (2015). Historical writing, speaking, and listening using informational texts in elementary curricula. *The Councilor: A Journal of the Social Studies*, 76(1), 1-16.
- Bickford, J. & Hunt, L. (2014) Common Core, informational texts, and the historical (mis)representations of Native Americans within trade books. *The Councilor: A Journal of the Social Studies*, 75(2), 1-16.
- Bickford, J. & Lindsay, M. (2017) Franklin Delano Roosevelt's historical representation in children's and young adult literature. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 12(2), 125-138.
- Bickford, J., & Rich, C. (2014a). Trade books' historical representation of Eleanor Roosevelt, Rosa Parks, and Helen Keller. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 9(1), 18-65.
- Bickford, J., & Rich, C. (2014b). Examining the representations of slavery within children's literature. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 9(1), 66-94.
- Bickford, J. & Rich, C. (2015a). Scrutinizing and supplementing children's literature about child labor. *Social Studies Research & Practice*, 10(1), 21-40.
- Bickford, J. & Rich, C. (2015b). The historical representation of Thanksgiving within primary- and intermediate-level children's literature. *Journal of Children's Literature*, 40(2), 5-21.
- Bickford, J. & Schuette, L. (2016). Trade books' historical representation of the Black Freedom Movement, slavery through civil rights. *Journal of Children's Literature*, 41(1), 20-43.
- Bickford, J., Schuette, L., & Rich, C. (2015). Examining the historical representation of the Holocaust within trade books. *Journal of International Social Studies*, 5(1), 4-50.
- Bickford, J. & Silva, K. (2016). Trade books' historical representation of Anne Sullivan Macy, *The Miracle Worker*. *Social Studies Research & Practice*, 11(1), 56-72.
- Booksource. Retrieved from <http://www.booksource.com/>
- Chick, K. (2006). Gender balance in k-12 American history textbooks. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 1(3), 284-290.
- Chick, K., & Corle, S. (2012). A gender analysis of NCSS Notable Trade Books for the intermediate grades. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 7(2), 1-14.



- Chick, K., Slekar, T., & Charles, E. (2010). A gender analysis of NCSS Notable picture book winners: 2006-2008. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 5(3), 21-31.
- Clark, R., Allard, J., & Mahoney, T. (2004). How much of the sky? Women in American high school history textbooks from the 1960s, 1980s and 1990s. *Social Education*, 68(1), 57-62.
- Desai, C. (2014). The Columbus myth: Power and ideology in picture books about Christopher Columbus. *Children's Literature in Education*, 45, 179-196. DOI 10.1007/s10583-014-9216-0
- Diamond, J. (2005). *Guns, germs and steel: A short history of everybody for the last 13,000 years*. London: Vintage.
- Diamond, J. (2011). *Collapse: How societies choose to fail or succeed*. New York, NY: Penguin.
- Eaton, G. (2006). *Well-dressed role models: The portrayal of women in biographies for children*. Lanham, MD: The Scarecrow Press, Inc.
- Eraqi, M. (2015). Inclusion of Arab-Americans and Muslim-Americans within secondary U.S. history textbooks. *Journal of International Social Studies*, 5(1), 2015, 64-80.
- Gilder Lehrman Institute of American History. Retrieved from <https://www.gilderlehrman.org/history-by-era/americas-1620/american-indians/primary-sources>
- Heafner, T. & Groce, E. (2007). Advocating for social studies: Documenting the decline and doing something about it. *Social Education*, 71(5), 255.
- House Joint Resolution 62, 110th Congress: Native American Heritage Day Act (2008) (enacted).
- Illinois State Laws (1961). American Indian Day. p. 31; Sec. 27 20. 105 ILCS 5/27 20; from Ch. 122, par. 27 20; http://www.isbe.net/ils/social_science/mandates_2.htm#history
- Krippendorff, K. (2013). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*, Third Edition. Washington, DC: Sage Publishing.
- Library of Congress. Retrieved from <http://www.loc.gov/>
- Library of Congress: Assimilation Through Education. Retrieved from <http://www.loc.gov/teachers/classroommaterials/themes/native-americans/set.html>
- Lindquist, D. (2009). The coverage of the Holocaust in high school history textbooks. *Social Education*, 73(6), 298-304.
- Lindquist, D. (2012). Textbook coverage of the destruction of the Armenians. *Journal of International Social Studies*, 2(1), 26-37.
- Loewen, J. (2007). *Lies my teacher told me: Everything your American history textbook got wrong*. New York: Simon and Schuster.
- Loewen, J. (2010). *Teaching what really happened: How to avoid the tyranny of textbooks and get students excited about doing history*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Mann, C. (2005). *1491: New revelations of the Americas before Columbus*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf Publications.
- Mann, C. (2011). *1493: Uncovering the new world Columbus created*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf Publications.
- Matusevich, M. (2006). Strange bedfellows: Censorship and history textbooks. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 1(3), 359-373.
- Maxwell, J. (2010). Using numbers in qualitative research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 16(6), 475-482.



- McMurrer, J.(2008). *Instructional time in elementary schools: A closer look at changes for specific subjects*. Washington, D.C.: Center on Education Policy.
- Miller, J. (2015). Never a fight of woman against man: What textbooks don't say about Women's Suffrage. *The History Teacher*, 48(3), 437-482.
- Monte-Sano, C., De La Paz, S. & Felton, M. (2014). *Reading, thinking, and writing about history: Teaching argument writing to diverse learners in the Common Core classroom, grades 6-12*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- National Archives and Records Administration. Retrieved from <http://www.archives.gov/research/native-americans/published-resources.html>
- National Council for the Social Studies (2013). *College, career, and civic life (C3) framework for social studies state standards: Guidance for enhancing the rigor of k-12 civics, economics, geography, and history*. Silver Spring, MD: NCSS.
- National Governors Association Center for Best Practices & Council of Chief State School Officers. (2010). *Common Core State Standards for English language arts and literacy in history/social studies, science, and technical subjects*. Washington, DC: Authors.
- Nokes, J. (2011). Recognizing and addressing the barriers to adolescents' "reading like historians." *The History Teacher*, 44(3), 379-404.
- NoveList. Retrieved from <https://www.ebscohost.com/novelist>
- Powers, C. (2003). Challenging the pluralism of our past: Presentism and the selective tradition in historical fiction written for young people. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 37(4), 425-466.
- Roberts, S. (2015). A review of social studies textbook content since 2002. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 9(3), 51-65.
- Sapers, J. (2015 February 26). Common Core's unintended consequences? More teachers write their own curricula. *The Hechinger Report: Covering Innovation and Inequality in Education*. Retrieved from <http://hechingerreport.org/common-cores-unintended-consequence/>
- Scholastic. Retrieved from www.scholastic.com/teachers/
- Schwebel, S. (2011). *Child-sized history: Fictions of the past in U.S. classrooms*. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press.
- Schwebel, S. (2014). Historical fiction, Common Core, and disciplinary habits of mind. *Social Education*, 78(1), 20-24.
- Smithsonian: Resources for Teaching American History. Retrieved from <http://www.smithsoniansource.org/display/primarysource/results.aspx?hId=1005>
- Tschida, C., Ryan, C., & Ticknor, A. (2014). Building on windows and mirrors: Encouraging the disruption of "single stories" through children's literature. *Journal of Children's Literature*, 40(1), 28-39.
- Williams, T. (2009). A closer look: The representation of slavery in the *Dear America* series. *Social Studies and the Young Learner*, 21(3), 26-29.
- Wilton, M., & Bickford, J. (2012). An elementary school's spiraled curriculum on Columbus: A case study. *Middle Ground Journal*, 5, 1-30. Retrieved from <http://resources.css.edu/academics/HIS/MiddleGround/articles/wilton.pdf>
- Wineburg, S. (2001). *Historical thinking and other unnatural acts: Charting the future of*



- teaching the past*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.
- Wineburg, S., & Martin, D. (2009). Tampering with history: Adapting primary sources for struggling readers. *Social Education*, 73(5), 212-216.
- Wineburg, S., Martin, D., & Monte-Sano, C. (2011). *Reading like a historian: Teaching literacy in middle and high school classrooms*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Wineburg, S., Smith, M., & Breakstone, J. (2012). New directions in assessment: Using Library of Congress sources to assess historical understanding. *Social Education*, 76(6), 290- 293.
- Zhang, Y., & Wildemuth, B. (2009). Qualitative analysis of content. In B. Wildemuth (Ed.) *Applications of Social Research Methods to Questions in Information and Library Science* (pp.308-319). Westport, CT: Libraries Unlimited.
- Zinn, H. (1980/2003). *A people's history of the United States*. New York, NY: HarperCollins.



Appendix I – Data Sample

- Ashrose, C. (1993). *The very first Americans*. Penguin Young Readers Group.
- Bruchac, J. (1998). *A boy called Slow*. Putnam and Grosset Group.
- dePaola, T. (1996). *The legend of the Indian paintbrush*. New York, NY: G.P. Putnam's Sons.
- Dorris, M. (1992). *Morning Girl*. New York, NY: G.P. Hyperion Paperbacks.
- Dorris, M. (1996). *Sees Behind Trees*. New York, NY: G.P. Hyperion Paperbacks.
- Earth, R. (1998). *Selu and Kana'Ti: Cherokee Corn Mother and Lucky Hunter*. New York, NY: Mondo Publishing.
- Evento, S. (2004). *Sitting Bull*. New York, NY: Scholastic Children's Press.
- Fradin, J. & Fradin, D. (2002). *Who Was Sacagawea?* New York, NY: Penguin Publishing.
- Fritz, J. (2002). *The Double Life of Pocahontas*. New York, NY: Penguin Publishing.
- Goble, P. (1988). *Her seven brothers*. New York, NY: Aladdin Paperbacks.
- Goble, P. (1997). *Dream Wolf*. New York, NY: Childrens Publishing Division.
- Jeffers, S. (1991). *Brother Eagle, Sister Sky*. New York, NY: Puffin Books.
- Jenner, C. (2000). *Pocahontas*. New York, NY: DK Publishing.
- Martin, B. & Archambault, J. (1966). *Knots on a counting rope*. New York, NY: Henry Holt & Company.
- Martin, R. (1992). *The Rough-face girl*. New York, NY: Putnam & Grosset Group.
- Matzke, A. (2013). *My life as a Native American*. North Mankato, MN: Rourke Educational Media.
- Mikaelsen, B. (2001). *Touching Spirit Bear*. New York, NY: Harper Collins Publishing.
- Pearsall, S. (2007). *Crooked River*. New York, NY: Yearling Publishing.
- Roessel, M. (1993). *Kinaalda: A Navajo girl grows up*. Minneapolis, MN: Lerner Publications.
- Tallchief, M. & Wells, R. (1999). *Tallchief, America's prima ballerina*. New York, NY: Puffin Books.



Appendix II – Content Analysis Tool

1. Author's name, publication date, title, company.
2. For (about) what age/grade was this book intended?
 - a. Primary (k-2)
 - b. Intermediate (3-5)
3. What is the book's genre?
 - a. Literature (historical fiction)
 - b. Informational Text (narrative non-fiction, expository, biography)
4. Who were the main characters? Please describe:
 - a. Native American
 - i. Name
 - ii. Age
 - iii. Gender
 - iv. Ethnicity/race/religion/tribe/occupation/role affiliation
 - v. Any other defining factors?
 - b. European
 - i. Name
 - ii. Age
 - iii. Gender
 - iv. Ethnicity/race/religion/tribe/occupation/role affiliation
 - v. Any other defining factors?
 - c. American
 - i. Name
 - ii. Age
 - iii. Gender
 - iv. Ethnicity/race/religion/tribe/occupation/role affiliation
 - v. Any other defining factors?
 - d. Animal
 - i. Name
 - ii. Age
 - iii. Gender
 - iv. Ethnicity/race/religion/tribe/occupation/role affiliation
 - v. Any other defining factors?
 - e. Other
5. What did the story call the Native Americans?
 - a. Native American
 - b. Indian
 - c. American Indian
 - d. Redskin
 - e. Tribal name
 - f. Other or did not use name



6. What about the Native American cultures were mentioned:
 - a. Animals
 - b. Farming
 - c. Hunting and gathering
 - d. Traditions/customs
 - e. Rights of passage
 - f. Religion
 - g. Dress
 - h. Language
 - i. Setting (houses, area, geography, etc.)
 - j. Resources and tools
 - k. Art
7. Were the following archetypal characteristics were presented in the story? If yes, were these historically representative and accurate with the tribe depicted?
 - a. Feathers
 - b. Tepees
 - c. Dances around the camp fire
 - d. Eating buffalo or deer
 - e. Growing corn
8. Did the story relate any historical connections between Native Americans and U.S. Government/Citizens or Native Americans and Europeans? If so, which historical events or issues?
 - a. Yes
 - b. No



Appendix III – Trade Books’ Composition

Author	Year Published	Targeted Grade	Genre
Ashrose	1990-1999	Prim (k-2)	Inf Text (NF)
Bruchac	1990-1999	Inter (3-5)	Lit (HF)
dePaola	1990-1999	Inter (3-5)	Inf Text (NF)
Dorris	1990-1999	Inter (3-5)	Lit (HF)
Dorris	1990-1999	Inter (3-5)	Lit (HF)
Earth	1990-1999	Prim (k-2)	Inf Text (NF)
Evento	2000-2009	Prim (k-2)	Inf Text (NF)
Fradin	2000-2009	Inter (3-5)	Inf Text (NF)
Fritz	2000-2009	Inter (3-5)	Lit (HF)
Goble	1980-1989	Prim (k-2)	Lit (HF)
Goble	1990-1999	Prim (k-2)	Inf Text (NF)
Jeffers	1990-1999	Prim (k-2)	Lit (HF)
Jenner	2000-2009	Prim (k-2)	Inf Text (NF)
Martin R	1990-1999	Prim (k-2)	Lit (HF)
Martin B	1960-1969	Prim (k-2)	Lit (HF)
Matzke	2010-present	Prim (k-2)	Inf Text (NF)
Mikaelsen	2000-2009	Inter (3-5)	Lit (HF)
Pearsall	2000-2009	Inter (3-5)	Lit (HF)
Roessel	1990-1999	Inter (3-5)	Inf Text (NF)
Tallchief	1990-1999	Inter (3-5)	Inf Text (NF)



Appendix IV – Individualized Findings

Author	Denotation	Cultural Elements	Archetypal Characteristics	Historical Connection
Ashrose	Specific tribal name	Six or More	Three-Five	Yes
Bruchac	Specific tribal name	Six or More	Three-Five	No
dePaola	Indian	Three-Five	Three-Five	No
Dorris	Other	Three-Five	Zero-Two	Yes
Dorris	Other	Three-Five	Zero-Two	Yes
Earth	Specific tribal name	Three-Five	Zero-Two	No
Evento	Indian	Three-Five	Three-Five	No
Fradin	Specific tribal name	Six or More	Zero-Two	Yes
Fritz	Specific tribal name	Six or More	Zero-Two	Yes
Goble	Other	Zero-Two	Three-Five	No
Goble	Other	Three-Five	Three-Five	No
Jeffers	Specific tribal name	Three-Five	Zero-Two	Yes
Jenner	Indian	Three-Five	Zero-Two	Yes
Martin R	Other	Three-Five	Zero-Two	No
Martin B	Other	Three-Five	Zero-Two	No
Matzke	Specific tribal name	Six or More	Three-Five	No
Mikaelsen	Specific tribal name	Six or More	Zero-Two	No
Pearsall	Specific tribal name	Three-Five	Zero-Two	Yes
Roessel	Specific tribal name	Six or More	Zero-Two	Yes
Tallchief	Specific tribal name	Six or More	Three-Five	Yes



Appendix V – Quantified Findings

Year Published	2010-present	1	5%
	2000-2009	6	30%
	1990-1999	11	55%
	1980-1989	1	5%
	1970-1979	0	
	1960-1969	1	5%
Age/Grade	Primary (k-2)	10	50%
	Inter (3-5)	10	50%
Genre	Lit (HF)	10	50%
	InfText (NF)	10	50%
Denotation	Native American	0	
	Indian	3	15%
	American Indian	0	
	Redskins	0	
	Specific tribal name	11	55%
	Other	6	30%
Cultural Elements	Zero-Two	1	5%
	Three-Five	11	55%
	Six or More	8	40%
Archetypal Characteristics	Zero-Two	12	60%
	Three-Five	8	40%
	Six or More	0	
Historical Connection	Yes	10	50%
	No	10	50%